

# Dorothea Dix Park

## Master Plan Executive Committee

Date: Thursday, April 26 – Friday, April 27, 2018  
Time: Various Meetings  
Location: Brooklyn, New York, various locations

## Meeting Summary

### Brooklyn Bridge Park Development Corporation Discussion with David Lowin, VP Real Estate of Brooklyn Bridge Park (BBP):

- Cost to build Brooklyn Bridge Park: \$400M
- Capital
  - State
    - \$85M from Port Authority- Governor's Contribution
  - City funds
    - \$55M from City
    - City decided to fund capital plan (\$300+M) as Mayor Bloomberg legacy
    - City Council approves capital budget
      - \$30-\$50M/year
  - Brooklyn Bridge Park Corporation- City created 501c(3), file 990, all \$\$ is developed from the park, all \$\$ goes back to park
- Operating Budget
  - Founding objectives
    - Operating \$\$ can't come from the City—it will take it away from other parks
    - Need stable, sustainable operating budget
    - Up to 20% of parkland could be used to generate revenue to support park operations
    - \*\*City and State offered capital money, then required community groups to come together and create consensus around acceptable park O&M sources. Principle that 20% of parkland could be used to generate revenue came from the community groups – NOT public entity or consultant.\*\*
    - Focus on non-residential b/c residential would privatize the park
    - Statement of principles (?) - get a copy
  - Look at designs, figure out expense, look at development sites and match development revenue with operational expenses
    - Development consultants

- Primary sources of revenue – ground leases, pilot payments, condo/HOA fees; also participation fee from hotel
- Only long-term leases (99 years), developers consider it an acquisition cost
- Vast majority of revenue comes in up front
- Get copies of leases
- Residential (rental v. condo) conversation is critical
  - Condo- large upfront payment, HOA fees
  - Rent-?
- Can you sell condos on a ground lease in NC?
- PILOT (payments in lieu of taxes) legislation was needed
  - Fake taxes (City Dept of Finance) assesses value sends to BBP they collect amount from condo owners \$\$ goes into BBP direct fund
- 5 real development sites
  - Combo new construction and renovation
  - Bible factory—getting payments before construction
  - Park phasing v. development phasing
  - Find an early operational stream
  - Develop buildings near Phase one of park development
  - Hotel is the most public private use
    - 200 room hotel
    - PILOT
    - Participation fee- % of profits
    - Hotel was pursued because it is a public amenity, public feel – NOT because money maker
  - Most private use is residential
  - PILOT is functioning like TIF
  - Condo/Hotel
    - Sliding scale mix (hotel vs. residential units)
  - 1200 units of development allowed across the site
    - 900 residential units actually built
    - 200 hotel units
  - Affordable units don't benefit the park as much as market units
  - Pier 6-140 units (100 units affordable, 40 units market) Market subsidizes affordable
    - 3 tiers, 80%-165% AMI
  - Less than 10% is developed, 1/2 existing, 1/2 new
- State Economic Development Agency established subsidiary- Empire State Development Corporation (100% wholly owned)
  - Brooklyn Bridge Park Development Corporation
    - Board 60% appointed by Gov, 40% by City
- Break it down into buildable chunks
  - Start with two entrances (Dix analogy is State Farmers Market, Governor Morehead School)

- Altering people's psychic maps
- Create development envelopes
- RFP processes
  - RFP to developers
    - Come in with design concept and designer
      - Choose a developer and designer in one (strong financial and strong design)
    - Establish a competitive bidding process for ground lease/development rights and seek out a park premium
- Ground floor focus on these buildings... activated (retail, restaurants, public-like space)
- 400,000 sq foot office/retail historic renovation- DUMBO
  - On State and National register
  - Went through 3 RFPs as restrictions relative to NRHP were altered/eased
  - In advance of bidding - BBP diminished risk of SHPO oversight by doing advance legwork and incorporating SHPO-approved ideas into RFPs for developer
- Current operational budget (sanitation, security, etc): \$11M
- Capital reserve budget (maintenance, replacement of park stuff):
- Maritime reserve paid for by park, maritime budget is largest line-item: \$300M (on top of \$400M)
- Park amenities inside each building (storage, restrooms, concessions, cart commissary, etc)
- Conservancy does Programming
  - Education, movie series, enviro education
  - Funded by donations (a couple \$M/year)
  - Started to advocate/lobby state park
  - Got the park deal done lost mission focus do programming
  - Public Art Fund/Photoville/Canoeing club
  - Staff at BBPC - includes 1 person in charge of partnerships. Think of the role as that of a curator. Plans programming with outside orgs like public art, kayaking
- City
  - Appoint presidents, board
  - Involvement of City in BBP is shrinking over time
  - NYPD, PEP- provides security, park enforcement patrol
- \$20M- brought in through development
  - 11M operating
  - 5M cap reserve
  - 4-5 maritime reserve

#### **Conversation with HR&A (Candace Damon, Connie Chung, Elizabeth Packer):**

- Capital: anticipated to be some public, mostly philanthropic
- Operating: anticipated to be public, earned income including real estate development
- Membership program: Best practice: Shelby Farms
- Earned Income: Food/bev, event income & rentals
- Development off-site does not generate as much revenue as development on-site

- .43x- off site tax increment; 6x- on site tax increment –
  - Development on site is ~14 times more valuable to city versus off
- Residential development pays the highest return
- Higher value uses = smaller footprint of development needed
- BBP Model: “We will pay for it, if you take care of it” (City says to Conservancy)
- Create a local development corporation
  - This entity must be -- “Accountable to the public, have the capacity to raise money and spend it responsibly” -- says Candace
  - Conservancy needs this too. Will want to know that there are competent managers in place for the park and its resources.
- Revenue generation is critical if you want to:
  - Ensure that the park does not draw resources away from other parks
- Development needs to be in service of the park
  - Residential development provides eyes on the park
  - Must be at the edges
- Candace notes that the Presidio is the one example of park revenue not primarily generated from residential
- In order to have a park for everyone we need to be able to pay for it
- Philanthropic contributions
  - Starting expectation from Conservancy is that public/private contributions to park capital are ~50/50
  - Question – what is the expected capacity for philanthropic contributions?
    - Conservancy believes they can raise ~\$50 million for phase 1; will take years to raise for add'l phases
  - Good target - phase 1 that costs ~\$75 - \$90 million
- Overarching principles regarding revenue:
  - The park will generate revenue for the benefit of the park and the community. It will not draw down the city’s allocations to other parks, other neighborhoods, and other services.
  - Nothing is allowed in the park that is not in the service of the park.

**Conversation with Adrian Benepe (AP), Director of the Trust for Public Land:**

- Recommends cross country trails as possibly program, partner with NC state cross country program
  - Why? Host meets and events and yet, low impact/not a lot of infrastructure required
- AB precedents he recommends:
  - Presidio
    - Note that after the fact, National Park Service determined that Presidio was not a good model because they lost more control than comfortable with
  - Governors Island and Hudson River Park boxed themselves in
    - Strict regulations at early stages restricted these 2 projects’ ability to generate their own revenue

- Recommendations
  - Be bold initially; include things that you are willing to give up/compromise on down the road
  - Designate catchy names to help public identify those things
  - Try to avoid saving 1950's style ranch housing
  - Matt Urbanski's (MU) Question to AB – do we need a shiny object?
    - AB – you don't need one big shiny object – but perhaps many small
    - Shiny object is that you're building the most important new urban park in America
  - Consider revenue stream from concerts
    - Consider early conversations with AEG, LiveNation
    - Randalls Island in NY is a successful model
    - Would need to create plug and play for temp event site up (high voltage power, water)
      - Festivals, conferences, art events
  - Give places at the park specific names
  - Put people in renderings
  - Talk about the experiences of landscape
    - How will people use it?
  - Offer something for everyone
- Kate Pearce (KP) asks – what are some relevant models for Dix to look to? AB says...
  - Golden Gate Nt'l Park + Crissy Field
  - Randall's Island – they have expertise in concert promotion
  - Parklands at Floyds Fork at Louisville \*\*also inland/non waterfront\*\*
  - Balboa Park in San Diego
  - LA central market – example of new food market models
    - Pikes Place Market
  - Hollywood, CA – great weekend farmers market
- AB's thoughts on conservancies
  - First rule of conservancies is that there are no consistent rules in how to do it; context and local community matters
  - Each side (public/private) gives up something
  - Private side should not do policing, should not make the rules about access – better if public does
  - If city can indemnify park conservancy in all cases except negligence – that is important. Costs city not much incrementally. Saves the conservancy organization from great risk potentially.
- Group likes \*\*Idea of food as an anchor for Dix\*\*
  - From farmers market to fields to grow it to high end
  - Mayor notes potential for culinary institute, build on Raleigh's food culture

**Landfill:**

- MPEC approval to fast track this work beyond master plan level; coordinate work with state DEQ, Rocky Branch remediation below
- Schedule meetings with the following:
  - Bill Ross
  - Cheryl & David- DEQ
- MVVA follow up: compose Early Phase 1 SD Scope

#### **Rocky Branch Creek Restoration:**

- MPEC approval to fast track this work beyond master plan level; coordinate work with landfill remediation
- Schedule meetings with the following
  - PUD and Stormwater
    - Water main timeline
    - Reuse line timeline
    - Mitigation banking credits?
  - Mitigation Services- DEQ
  - NC DOT – regarding land bridge
- MVVA follow up: compose Early Phase 1 SD Scope
  - Include land bridge

#### **Governor Morehead School (GMS) Connection:**

- Schedule meetings with the following:
  - Department of Public Instruction/DOA
  - Barbria Bacon, GMS
  - Put their broader planning on the back burner
  - Scope out and look at their highest priorities
- Peace University is no longer pursuing GMS as a partner for field sharing
- Concepts:
  - A school in the park. GMS as part of Dix Park. Great opportunity for amenities for their students.
  - Move Ashe Avenue along prison property
- Idea: Name land bridge after Mr. Benton
- MVVA to develop 2 plans of GMS now:
  - 1 with Ashe Ave in place, as is
  - 1 with Ashe removed and altered

#### **State Farmers Market (SFM):**

- Schedule meetings with the following
  - Kristen Hess/Utile/MVVA
    - Utile- to provide best practices case examples
    - Discuss with HH the need for a Market Master Plan
      - Conservancy to help cover costs

- Request that SFM pause on the parking lot project/new entrance from Maywood Ave.
- Important adjacent connections
  - to Carolina Pines/Caraleigh/Fuller Heights
  - to Walnut Creek Wetland Greenway
- City is now working with DOA on an immediate connection to Farmers Market
- How can we make this one of the top farmers markets in the world?
- What about the “bold” gateway entrance?
- MVVA to provide guiding principles for park/market interaction
- Recommendation from the Mayor: phase 2 development at Farmers Market should move truck/wholesale traffic to the side – to be parallel with railroad

#### **NCSU Centennial and Spring Hill:**

- Schedule meeting with MVVA, Office of Real Estate, Centennial developers
- Align transportation efforts
- MVVA to provide design principles and renderings of potential development
  - Ken Bowers recommends requiring building front doors on the park side, putting bldg. service to side lanes
- Real estate market estimation from Carlton Midyette: demand for residential/condo development at Spring Hill would be high
- Dix Park Development Corporation (a la Brooklyn Bridge Park Real Estate)
  - Dix Corporation could be the developer of residential lots at NCSU land along Dix Big Field; NCSU gets the ground lease revenue

#### **What are all the different reasons people come to the park?**

- Wander around
- Walk the dog
- Let the kids play
- Moments of discovery/whimsy
- Secret gardens
- People watch
  - To go to programmed events
  - Set a stage without people knowing it
- Ponder, contemplate
- Gardens, botanical
- Amphitheater/Performance venue-
  - who are the theater consultants in Raleigh? 5,000-7,000 ppl
  - Important - not just concerts with popular music, but space also supports cultural events
  - Reference – Koka Booth in Cary, NC
- Restaurants and eating
- Facilities for family reunions
- Unique attractions

- Water environments
  - possibly swimming
  - Off-line, nature water play
  - Reference from Ken Bowers - Olympic splash pad in Atlanta, GA
- Artisans, studio space, craft
  - Reference - Balboa Park in San Diego, CA
  - Textiles, crafts
    - Reference from Kay Crowder - Penland School in NC, see early August events
- Escape

#### Values:

- Serene, wild, imaginative
- Fun
- Relaxing
- Unexpected
- Green
- Iconic
- Pastoral
- Breathtaking
- Cinematic device, moments of discovery
- Amplified landscape qualities
- Natural beauty
- The Park is our “Shiny Thing”
  - You want a Park that is the institution
  - Its Amplified Landscape Qualities
  - Michael Van Valkenburgh notes that the park loop can be thought of as a cinematic device, a series of moments and positions. Specific moments where you are pointed [to look] at things. This experience will amplify qualities of the existing and enhanced landscape. The loop will be the iconic/magnetic/memorable moment at the park.

#### MVVA To Dos:

- Guiding Principles
  - For our edges/urban design
  - For the buildings
  - For the overall park
  - What else?
- How do we choreograph the experience?
  - Circulation patterns- complete system of movement (car, bike, ped)
- Consider performance space at the park
  - Test fit area near Power Plant building
  - Describe facility potential, model capacity



- MVVA to convene working session with City Planning, Ken Greenberg to create “unofficial” Fuller Heights plan, refine recommended principles for Fuller Heights development that city can carry forward via small area plan.
- MVVA to do site plan options at Governor Morehead School.

**City To Dos:**

- What access and services City is obligated/should provide if facility stays- i.e., sidewalks, transit?
  - City to initiate small area plan for the Fuller Heights neighborhood
- Schedule meetings with the following:
  - Bill Ross
  - Cheryl & David- DEQ
  - PUD and Stormwater
  - Mitigation Services- DEQ
  - NC DOT - regarding land bridge
  - Department of Public Instruction/DOA
  - Barbria Bacon, GMS
  - NC State re: Spring Hill and Centennial Campus
  - State Farmers Market re: fast-tracking work with Kristen Hess + Dix Master Plan